

Radical? Feminist? Nationalist? The Canadian Paradox of Edith Fowke¹

Pauline Greenhill, University of Winnipeg

Historical perspectives on academic folksong study in English Canada have tended to stress the extensive influence of foreign models.² The ethnographic, functionalist perspective brought from the United States to the Folklore department of Memorial University of Newfoundland by Herbert Halpert in 1962 dominated academic fieldwork and song analysis until quite recently. At the beginning of the twentieth century, Canadian W. Roy Mackenzie studied his own Nova Scotia regions and traditions, but used models he had learned in the U.S. The British Maud Karpeles based her folksong collection in Newfoundland on that of her mentor, Cecil Sharp. Americans Elisabeth Bristol Greenleaf and Grace Yarrow Mansfield also collected in Newfoundland, as students of Martha W. Beckwith at Vassar College and George Lyman Kittredge at Harvard.

The twentieth century also saw local collectors, gathering and studying their own regions' song traditions, without a foreign scholarly departure point. Most such individuals were women, and some (like Helen Creighton in Nova Scotia and Edith Fowke in Ontario) were able to turn their avocations into a life's work. These two did not work in complete intellectual isolation from the American and British scholarly scenes in folklore and ethnology, but they were extremely selective about what they chose to use--and often scathing in their dismissal and disapproval of what they saw as ideas or techniques inappropriate to their own milieux. They wanted good, clear, intrinsically compelling texts; the ethnographic context was taken for granted--they were insiders not outsiders to it. Their indigenous Anglo-Canadian perspectives on folksong collection and analysis reckoned the value of traditional culture in historic, regional, and national terms. Their models and perspectives can be deduced in the material they chose to publish and the diverse formats they employed.³

Edith Fowke was born in Lumsden, Saskatchewan in 1913 and died in Toronto, Ontario in 1996. She was perhaps best known among Canadians for her compendia of Canadian folksongs, and for her two collections of Canadian children's rhymes and folklore. However, she was also internationally reputed among folklorists and ethnologists for her field collections of traditional song texts, notably

Traditional Singers and Songs from Ontario (1965) and *Lumbering Songs from the Northern Woods* (1970).

Some keys to Edith Fowke's place in Canadian folkloristics--particularly in relation to Helen Creighton's--emerged in historian Ian McKay's ground-breaking *The Quest of the Folk* (1994). Near contemporaries, the two women nevertheless retained throughout their lives fundamentally different sociopolitical outlooks. McKay asserts "One reason for Creighton's strained relationship with Fowke...was the absence of any clear boundaries separating their areas of jurisdiction. Fowke, *who defined her field as all of Canada* seems to have angered Creighton by not deferring to Creighton's *claims to control of almost all Nova Scotian materials*" (my emphasis, 141). Clearly, Creighton defined her relationship to folklore, folklife, and ethnology in regional terms, and Fowke in national terms. Now notorious thanks to McKay is Creighton's 1960 attempted denunciation of Fowke as a communist to Carmen Roy. Roy headed the Folklore Division of the National Museum of Man in Ottawa,⁴ and employed both women as fieldworkers. McKay makes much of Creighton's political conservatism and her evident fear of Fowke's radical connections.⁵ Yet as a folklorist looking at Fowke's oeuvre in collecting and analysing folksong and other forms of traditional culture, I see less intellectual divergence between the two than their politics might suggest.

Creighton wrote an autobiography, *A Life in Folklore* (1975), and has been the subject of a full-length biography (Croft 1999). Her work has received feminist scholarly analysis from folklorist Diane Tye⁶ as well as figuring prominently in McKay's study. However, Edith Fowke has not hitherto had the attention her contributions deserve.⁷

I will focus here upon Fowke's paradoxical relation to Canadian folklore/ethnology studies and to the discipline as a whole. First, as already indicated, though Fowke was politically radical, her academic folklore studies were generally conservative. Second, for one who repeatedly described herself as "a feminist before there was such a term" (e.g. Fowke 1997:40), she generally failed to apply feminist

analysis to her own position as a female academic nor to her discussions of traditional and popular culture. Third, though an ardent nationalist who described much of her own work in nation-building and Canadianist terms, she tended to dismiss other Canadian scholarship in folklore/ethnology and to belittle the recognition she received from her ethnologist/folklorist peers. Yet finally, despite connections with British and American folklore scholars, and with the British and American folksong revivals of the late twentieth century, her folklore research and output, I will argue, remains distinctively Canadian.



Photograph of Edith Fowke by Peter Tym, courtesy of the *Fonds Edith Fowke*, Special Collections, University of Calgary

Politically Radical/Academically Conservative

It may not be coincidental that I only once saw Edith Fowke wearing any colour other than pink. Politically, she was decidedly red-tinged. Fowke herself described her activities in the 1940s and 1950s as “political and pacifist....For a dozen years...I spent most of my time working for the Cooperative Commonwealth Federation,...the Fellowship of Reconciliation, the Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom, the Co-operative Committee for Japanese Canadians, the Canadian Forum, and the Woodsworth Memorial Foundation” (Fowke 1997:39-40). Works attending to Fowke as a folklorist tend to downplay her activities with the

major left political and social movements of the day. Yet it is clear the links were extensive. Though many studies of the CCF (forerunner of the mildly left New Democratic Party) do not mention her involvement,⁸ two later studies include her.⁹

Fowke did, however, research labour, political, and protest songs. Her collection *Songs of Work and Freedom* (with Joe Glazer) was first published in 1960.¹⁰ Like many of Fowke’s earlier compendia, it consisted primarily of song texts with piano arrangements and guitar chords. Its introduction comments, “This is no book for resting on a quiet library shelf. It will be in constant use--well-thumbed--as union men and women and their children sing to piano or guitar at home, at union meetings, at summer schools in this country, and, we predict, in other countries of the world” (1973:5). Only a few songs in the latter collection have recognisable connections to Canada: “A Miner’s Life” (65-67), “Kevin Barry” (194-195), “Drill, Ye Tarriers Drill” (86-87), “Hold the Fort” (36-37), “Canaday-I-O” (118-119), “United Steelworkers Are We” (92-93), and “No More Auction Block” (173). But other songs in the collection would also be familiar to many Canadians, from “Solidarity Forever” (12-13) to “John Brown’s Body” (170-172).

A comparison between the contents of this collection and Fowke’s only academic publication on the topic is telling. She opens the article with the unequivocal statement: “Although Canada is very rich in occupational songs, we have comparatively few industrial songs” (1969:34). She arbitrarily limits industrial songs to “work resulting from the Industrial Revolution--mining, railroading, and manufacturing” and labour songs to “those growing out of conflict between workers and their employers” (*ibid.*). Canada’s historically resource-based economy would preclude the former, but as Fowke herself points out, industries like sealing in Newfoundland and lumbering in Ontario are strongly associated with singing traditions and engendered multiple texts.¹¹ And her limitation of labour songs to anti-boss material, as folklorist Peter Narváez suggests, shows that “she was too locked into the idea of explicit ‘labour’ songs of social protest, i.e. organized workers, to the exclusion of counter-hegemonic occupational songs exhibiting social consciousness. Given the latter perspective, I’ve noticed many songs of that ilk in Newfoundland and I’m sure the rest of Canada exhibits many as well, particularly given the prevalence of the single-industry community (mining, paper, lumber), where class is dramatised in everyday life” (personal communication, May 28, 2003).¹²

In Canada, many miners and most who built the cross country railroads were not English or French speakers. (Most analyses suggest that Europeans found the work too difficult.) The Asian railroad workers may have had singing traditions, but to my knowledge they were never collected. Fowke does not seem to have considered the effect of these labourers' ethnicity and language on the Canadian radical folksong repertoire.

But even given the fact that she looked only at English and French songs, and with her own imposed limitations to anti-boss songs and material from secondary industry, Fowke goes on in "Labor and Industrial Protest Songs in Canada" to discuss a total of twenty-nine texts. The songs come from British Columbia, Newfoundland, Ontario, Nova Scotia, Saskatchewan, and Quebec, and only five of them also appear in *Songs of Work and Protest*. Some are structured around apparently apolitical tunes, such as "United Steelworkers Are We" based on Newfoundlander Art Scammel's "The Squid-Jiggin Ground," or the parodies of "Onward Christian Soldiers" (40) or "My Bonnie Lies Over the Ocean" (48). Others more clearly demonstrate their radical roots. Fowke's article includes an English parody of "The Battle Hymn of the Republic" (48) and a French parody of "We Shall Not Be Moved" (47). Even more complex connections manifest in a French C.I.O. (Congress of Industrial Organizations) song which parodies the English C.I.O. "North of the Border," itself a parody of "South of the Border in Old Mexico" (46-47).

Strong connections between workers across the Canada/U.S. border are implied in the article. Yet the manifestly radical songs of Cape Breton miners (see e.g. O'Donnell 1992) and Newfoundland fishers and sealers (see e.g. Ryan and Small 1978) discussed in it are nowhere to be found in *Songs of Work and Protest* (henceforth *SWP*), which privileges works best known in the U.S. and Britain. Indeed, the contents of her article belie Fowke's own conclusion that "Canadian workers have been less militant and less inclined to sing about their grievances than their neighbors to the south" (Ibid.:49). Consider the Newfoundland version of "Hard, Hard Times":

Oh the times are so bad that we hardly can live--
There's nothing to ask and there's nothing to give.
There's nothing to ask and there's nothing to give,
And it's hard, hard times.
But never mind, friends, let us work with a will.
When we finish down here we'll be hauled on the hill,
And there they will lay us deep down in the cold--
When all here is finished, you're still in the hole,
And it's hard, hard times (44).

Perhaps Fowke mistook the sardonic tone for resignation. Or perhaps her dismissal of Canadian radical song traditions is another example of what I call her international envy--a tendency to downplay Canadian material in favour of American and British ones. Her academic conservatism apparently blinded her to the significance of material in her own milieu.

Canadian Culture/International Envy

There is no Canadian folklorist/ethnologist more associated with Canada than Edith Fowke. Though some of her works are regionally or genre-identified, numerous books, records, and articles have "Canada," or "Canadian" in the title, and many clearly aim to define a genre in national terms, such as: *Folk Songs of Canada* (Fowke and Johnston 1954); "O Canada: A History in Song" (Fowke and Mills 1956); *Canada's Story in Song* (1960); *Tales Told in Canada* (1986), and *Red Rover, Red Rover: Children's Games Played in Canada* (1988b). In addition, three of Fowke's books attempted national coverage of (mainly Anglo) folklore/ethnology: she compiled *Folklore of Canada* (1976); co-compiled *Explorations in Canadian Folklore* (Fowke and Carpenter 1985), and wrote *Canadian Folklore* (1988a).

Yet Fowke clearly felt rejected and unappreciated by the discipline of folklore/ethnology in Canada. She was disappointed by the reaction of many academic folklorists in Canada to her work and responded with disdain. In an interview conducted for the American Folklore Society Women's Section in 1987 by Kenneth S. Goldstein, Fowke asserted: "I do feel discriminated against by Canadian academics--academic folklorists--because I haven't got a degree in folklore."¹³ Many of the "Canadian" academics to whom Fowke refers were immigrants from the U.S. or Britain, hired to teach in the Folklore department at Memorial. Bringing perspectives from their foreign training, they failed to recognise Fowke's Canadianist project (see Doucette 1993 and 1997; Greenhill and Narváez 2002).

Fowke tended to tar all Canadian academics with the same brush, however. Mentioning honours she had received, Fowke listed: "Member of the Order of Canada, Fellow of the [American] Folklore Society. And I've just been made a life member of the children's section of the American Folklore Society." When Goldstein queried her further, she commented she had received from "the Folklore Studies [Association of Canada], the Distinguished Folklorist. I don't think that had any great influence." It's unclear whether Fowke was indicating that the

Association or the award lacked influence. But note that Fowke was in fact the first recipient of the Distinguished Canadian Folklorist Prize, the first award ever offered by FSAC/ACEF, in 1978. Surely by most assessments such a distinct honour would offer an indication of the respect of the academics who formed the association.

Like her definition of labour and industrial songs, then, Fowke's definition of Canadian folklore was exclusive. Of the then Canadian Centre for Folk Culture Studies,¹⁴ she noted: "a lot of what they're collecting from the multicultural groups is not Canadian, it's been brought by first generation people from other countries. My definition of Canadian folklore is that it's survived here for at least one generation." Such a description leaves no room for new local songs, among many other forms generally considered by folklorists/ethnologists.

Fowke's story of Canada, as reflected in her popular song collections, is a male epic. The introduction to *Folk Songs of Canada* refers to "the French Canadian habitants who sang as they cleared their farms along the St. Lawrence...the sailors and fishermen of our maritime provinces who sang as they ran up the sails or pulled in the nets...the sod busters of the prairies" (Fowke and Johnston 1954:9). *Canada's Story in Song* (henceforth *CSS*) adds battles and conquest to its epic tale: "Brave Wolfe" (48-49, see also 50-51) and "brave General Brock" ("Come All You Bold Canadians," (64-65, see also 66-67) are among the military characters. Political songs feature such characters as William Lyon Mackenzie (72-73) and Sir Francis Bond Head (74-75). The Miners and Prospectors section of *CSS* atypically includes reference to actual women. "The Frank Slide" mentions "wives and children" killed in a rock slide, as well as a "baby girl" who miraculously survived. But the other songs are entirely about male characters and male work.¹⁵

Although the dominance of male characters is in part a reflection of the Anglo-British genres Fowke and Mills feature in *CSS*, only one song is entitled with a woman's name, "Sally Greer" (92-93), compared with seven named after men. Only "The Poor Little Girls of Ontario" (147-149) and "The Saskatchewan Girl's Lament" (150-151) describe female cohorts; in contrast sixteen texts concern male individuals or groups of men from "Vive les matelots" (21-24) and "Le sergent" (64-65) to "The Honest Irish Lad" (89-91) and "The Toronto Volunteers" (130-131). I'm not suggesting that Fowke and Mills deliberately overlooked songs about women, their work, and their contributions to Canadian history. However, for a

collection which purports to present "Canada's Story," it is clear that the tales told here are quite selective, and not only in gendered terms.

In *CSS*, all songs not in English are translated into that language, including those in French. First Nations people are partly historicised, featured in the section "Before the White Man" in *CSS* (Fowke and Mills 1960). "An Iroquois Lullaby" (2-3) is recycled in *Canadian Vibrations* (1972), along with "A Tsimshian Song of Welcome" (6-7) and "An Eskimo Weather Chant" (8-9). But First Nations people appear elsewhere in *CSS*. "The Indian's Lament" (86-88) points to the replacement of aboriginal with European culture. "Riel's Song" (124-126) (to his sister) notes "les malheurs du Canada" (125) and "Pork, Beans, and Hard Tack" (127-129) records the 1885 European volunteers who "leave their homes on starving pay to take the nitchies¹⁶ life" (127). "Falcon's Song" (121-123) is explicitly celebratory; its Métis author records the victory of the Bois-Brulés at Seven Oaks. Fowke and Mills included a good variety of perspectives on aboriginal culture. Once again, Fowke's position is paradoxical--inclusive of First Nations, yet excluding immigrant groups other than the French and English.¹⁷

Feminist/Anti-Feminist

Fowke chose to include in *SWP* a relatively trivial song like:

Are you sleeping, are you sleeping,
Brother John, Brother John?
Up and join the union, up and join the union,
A-F-L, C-I-O (sung to the tune of "Frère Jacques")
(Fowke and Glazer 1973:29)

And yet the following never made its way into her works:

In the kitchen or factory
Women do not know their power,
We are here to gloat upon it;
This is woman's little hour.
(Chorus:)
CCF'ers, CCF'ers when we women all combine
We're the ladies to raise hades with the Grit and Tory
line (sung to the tune of Clementine)
(Melnyk 1989:75).

SWP is also extremely male in orientation, and paradoxical given Fowke's hyperbolic self-description as "a feminist before there was such a term" (1997:40)¹⁸ As indicated above, she appears to have brought little or no feminist consciousness to her Canadian song collections which effectively marginalise women. And yet she claims: "As a member of the CCF Women's Committee, I helped draft the first Ontario equal-pay law. Agnes

MacPhail introduced it in the Ontario legislature, and though it wasn't passed, it prompted the government to introduce their own inferior bill a little later" (Ibid.).¹⁹ Fowke's lack of feminist analysis does not stem from any conservatism in the political perspective of the CCF Status of Women committee, of which Fowke was a member. They collected some pretty radical material, including "Women are Household Slaves," by Edith Stern, "How Free are Women?" by Valerie Stone, "Woman Against Myth," by Betty Millard, and "The Exploited Sex", by Charlotte Whitton.²⁰

In the 1987 AFS women's section interview, Fowke commented: "I was a feminist back in my CCF days. I resented the fact that the executives, the people running the party were largely men, and they expected the women to run teas and raise money for them." Yet despite her consciousness and sense of unfairness in the gendered division of labour, her feminism also seems restrictive and compartmentalised. For example, when asked about women's equality in the academy, she asserted of her own institution, York University, "Well in the English department I think that it's fairly equal. I think I would need to check up, but my impression is that there are just about as many women professors as men." Fowke was indeed fortunate to be at York, where "To my memory the gender balance was pretty well as Edith recalls. There were many untenured faculty, but that group also included a reasonably balanced number of males and females" (Terry Goldie, personal communication, June 8, 2003). In the same interview, Kenneth Goldstein asked her, "How about women's attitudes and concerns being expressed in folklore? Do women have a special set of attitudes and concerns that they express folklorically?" Fowke replied, "I don't think so. For example I have both men and women singing "The Farmer's Cursst Wife," which (laughs) is a male chauvinist song....Both men and women sing many of the same songs." Fowke apparently did not delve into subtle differences in repertoire, for example, that women often have proportionally more songs with bold female characters (see e.g. Greenhill 1995), or introduce subtle textual differences. In the case of "The Farmer's Cursst Wife," women singers often conclude:

So it's true that the women are better than men.

They go down to hell and come back again
whereas men usually sing:

It's true that the women are worse than the men

They go down to hell and come back again.

When Goldstein asked: "Do you feel that there are problems or issues involving the differences...between men and women in terms of status...in terms of

positions in the...American Folklore Society or the Canadian Folklore Society [sic: Folklore Studies Association of Canada]...and the kind of status that they earn outside of the Folklore Society?" Fowke replied "I don't think so. In both societies there have been women who have been quite active, both have had women presidents, women on the executives."²¹ Fowke seems relatively naive about differences in status or in representation for women. She continued, "I don't, you know I've never felt discriminated against [except]...in the Royal Society. I felt it was a big issue because of the very small number of women there." She noted, however, that at York "at one point there was a survey to evaluate women and men's salaries. I wasn't even going to bother submitting on that but my friend Clara Thomas told me I should so I put it in and as a result I got a couple thousand dollars extra." When Goldstein pressed her on unequal pay, she said "yes...which in York has been corrected. But also I think the proportion of men to women is not in balance. I mean it's far from equal....I mean almost without exception in universities there are more men than women on the faculty." Her comments certainly applied to the situation at Memorial's Folklore Department at the time. Only one woman had been hired in a tenure track position, and she would not be joined by another female faculty member until 1995. This situation persisted despite the fact that in the graduate program, women students had predominated for quite some time.

Fowke argued that unequal pay resulted because "until comparatively recently women were not tied to particular jobs, and were a little freer to go out collecting....It's only recently that collecting has been a paid occupation. Most of us did it on our own....Helen Creighton, myself, Barbara Cass-Beggs, well of course Elisabeth Greenleaf was more or less sponsored." She is certainly correct that women's lack of paid work opportunities may have allowed them more freedom to direct their own schedules--note that both Fowke and Creighton were child-free. However, lack of outside paid income was hardly an advantage when those women needed to support themselves (as was certainly the case for Creighton). Fowke failed to connect the fact that fieldwork was women's work and generally unpaid or underpaid with the status of women's work generally. As long as women generally did fieldwork in folklore/ethnology, it would remain "a labour of love" (Luxton 1980). In contrast, analysis and theorising, which was defined as male, must be paid work.

Fowke was, however, astute enough to note: "I think....it's rather interesting that there does seem to

be a predominance of women collectors in Canada." While much of her general and Canadian work fostered male views, her only two books focussing upon individuals were about women: Irish storyteller Alice Kane (Fowke and Kane 1983) and Ontario traditional singer LaRena Clark (Fowke and Rahn 1994). She opens the latter by saying "Folksinging is one art in which women have always excelled. Here they have been able to hold their own with men because this is an art that can be learned and practiced in the home. It does not require any special education or training, the lack of which has so consistently handicapped women in other fields....Simply put, men tend to sing outside the home and women sing within it. However, the great women singers transcend that boundary. Originally, most of them learned and sang their songs in the home but many went on to sing them in public as well" (Fowke and Rahn 1994:1). She notes that both female and male singers tend to learn their songs from their mothers. But her nascent feminist consciousness never went further in her studies of traditional culture.

Heartland/Hinterland/Canadian

Edith Fowke's place as an analyst of Canadian traditional culture can be seen best in comparison with her contemporary, Creighton. Creighton's family origin and scholarly focus alike were in the hinterland region of the Maritimes. Fowke was born and grew up in the prairie hinterlands, specifically Saskatchewan. In Canada, as elsewhere, hinterlands are more likely than heartlands to be defined, locally as well as nationally, as folkloric. Early folklorists and ethnologists saw urban centres as sophisticated and civilised, in contrast with outlying rural areas which were quaint, unsophisticated, and thus almost definitionally folkloric. Creighton's intellectual focus attended to the rural, fishing and farming cultures outside the urban centre of Halifax; she looked to the kinds of places easily recognised as folksy. Fowke, on the other hand, did not look to her home region of the prairies for traditional culture. She was influenced by John Robins, English professor at the University of Toronto, who pointed her to the heritage of British song. She quite rightly assumed that the Prairies, settled extensively by people of eastern European origin, would not be a good location to find such material. Instead, she sought the historic British settlements around Peterborough, and her research more or less snowballed from that point. In short, Fowke conducted most of her field research in the very heart of the heartland--southern Ontario. Even so, she defined herself, and this fieldwork, in a

very central Canadian way, as "Canadian" rather than specifically (that is, regionally) Ontarian.²²

As McKay rightly points out, Fowke saw all of Canada as her bailiwick, publishing *Folk Songs of Quebec* (Fowke and Mills 1957), *Folk Tales of French Canada* (1979), and *Sea Songs and Ballads from Nineteenth-Century Nova Scotia* (1981), as well as her Canadian and Ontario works. A colleague once described Fowke as an Ontario folklorist, and while she was not born in the province, her attitude is very much in keeping with Ontario perspectives on Canada. She defined the major sociopolitical issue in both Canadian traditional culture and its study as the constant conversation and argument (or rift and rapprochement) between Ontario (English) and Quebec (French). For Canadians outside those two provinces, bilingualism is usually only a minimal concern, replaced by issues of sovereignty vis-à-vis the federal government, economic problems, and cultural influences from beyond the borders. The predominant languages may be Ukrainian, German, or Chinese. Further, Fowke's central Canadian view saw First Nations people as the predecessors of the English and French, displaced by them. In the hinterlands, aboriginal people and their culture often remain visible as an element of contemporary life.

Ultimately, the works for which Fowke is celebrated as a folklorist highlight much the same British origin and English language materials as Creighton worked with. Their specific regional and generic foci differed, but in common they tended to present folklore as heritage (of the past), and class-inflected: rural, in Creighton's case; and rural or working class, in Fowke's. I must admit that it's a bit hard to imagine Helen Creighton putting her name to a collection like *Canadian Vibrations* (1972). Yet Fowke's division of that book into five sections--Contemporary Canada, Songs of Canada's Past, Other Peoples of Canada, Our National Anthem, and Keep Right on Singing--betrays not only her assumptions that English and French songs form the primary heritage of Canadians, but also that folksongs are of the past. Perhaps the most compelling section is the last; it has no words or music, only titles. Among the English language songs are works by the Beatles, Joni Mitchell, and Bob Dylan--but in addition to the numerous French songs are ones in Yiddish, German, Italian, Spanish, Chinese, Portuguese, Latin--and other languages I could not identify. Fowke does not call these folksongs, but her strong connections with the folk revival in Canada obviously attuned her to a wide range of materials.

Both Fowke and Creighton viewed traditional folksongs as fortunate survivals from history. Both adhered to a literary aesthetic, favouring texts they saw as complete and comprehensible. Both were catholic in their collection but considerably more selective in their publication, favouring materials of older British heritage as having authenticity. While by no means as elitist as some of the collectors Peter Narváez (1995) discusses, who worked in Newfoundland, both Fowke and Creighton linked folksongs to social class. Significantly, Fowke apparently could never bring herself to call the labour material or the later songs she includes in *Canadian Vibrations* “folksong.” While she was more compelled by their contents than was Creighton, she maintained an ideological distance between them and the real traditional stuff.

Both Creighton and Fowke do, however, exemplify the “trajectory” of Canadian ethnology/folkloristics, as identified by Peter Narváez (1992, see also Greenhill and Narváez 2002a and b). They both worked as popularisers, ensuring that the material they collected was not just given back to the people, but actively used by them. Both operated extensively in popular print and broadcast media; Fowke enthusiastically embraced computers and the opportunities they brought for research and writing. Both (although Fowke more than Creighton) in various ways incorporated new and local material (although each distinguished it from authentic traditional culture). And each was influenced by, and herself influenced, the folk revival in Canada, and indeed, internationally.

Bibliography

- Azoulay, Dan. *Keeping the Dream Alive: The Survival of the Ontario CCF/NDP, 1950-1963*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1997.
- Bartlett, Jon. “It Remains for Someone to Take Up the Task of Producing an Authentic History in Song of Canada”, *Canadian Folklore canadien*, 6 #1-2 (1984), 141-148.
- Bradley, Michael. *Crisis of Clarity: The New Democratic Party and the Quest for the Holy Grail*. Toronto: Summerhill Press, 1985.
- Carpenter, Carole Henderson. *Many Voices: A Study of Folklore Activities in Canada and Their Role in Canadian Culture*. Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1979.
- Creighton, Helen. *A Life in Folklore*. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1975.

Finally....

I don't wish to suggest that Fowke was not radical, feminist, or nationalist; I'm suggesting instead that the radical, feminist, and nationalist qualities that seemed to pervade her other activities do not seem to have made their way into her studies of traditional culture. My comments may be seen as critical of Fowke and her work. I prefer to think of them as a respectful disagreement (see also Greenhill and Tye 1994). The academics who taught me in the 1970s and 1980s failed to take Fowke, Creighton, and their ilk seriously at all, dismissing them as mere collectors, popularisers, and describers, in contrast with these men's own work which was theoretical and analytical. Fowke recognised her own paradoxical position: “folklorists...consider me a popularizer--which is apparently a very bad thing to be--while folkniks consider me a purist--also a bad thing” (Fowke 1997:45). She evidently wanted her work recognised and legitimated on both sides, and perhaps here is the source for what I see as a compartmentalisation in her work. Her academic work became more narrow and restrictive as she attempted to seek legitimacy in too often mutually contradictory locations. For a woman so opinionated and direct, she perhaps failed to recognise and foster her own intuitive understanding. And yet her insights shine through in much of her work, and her oeuvre stands as a consistent and informed commentary on both Canadian traditional culture and the disciplines it engendered.

Croft, Clary. *Helen Creighton: Canada's First Lady of Folklore*. Halifax: Nimbus Publishing, 1999.

Doucette, Laurel. “Voices Not Our Own”, *Canadian Folklore canadien*, 15 #2 (1993):119-137.

Doucette, Laurel. “Reclaiming the Study of Our Cultural Lives”, in *Undisciplined Women: Tradition and Culture in Canada*, eds. Pauline Greenhill and Diane Tye, pp. 20-27. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1997.

Fowke, Edith, ed. *Traditional Singers and Songs from Ontario*. Hatboro, Pa.: Folklore Associates, 1965.

Fowke, Edith, ed. *Lumbering Songs of the Northern Woods*. Austin, TX: American Folklore Society, 1970.

Fowke, Edith, ed. *Folklore of Canada*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1976.

Fowke, Edith, ed. *Folk Tales of French Canada*. Toronto: NC Press, 1979.

- Fowke, Edith, ed. *Sea Songs and Ballads from Nineteenth-Century Nova Scotia: The William H. Smith and Fenwick Hatt Manuscripts*. New York: Folklorica Press, 1981.
- Fowke, Edith, ed. *Tales Told in Canada*. Toronto: Doubleday, 1986.
- Fowke, Edith, ed. *Canadian Folklore*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Fowke, Edith, ed. *Red Rover, Red Rover: Children's Games Played in Canada*. Toronto: Doubleday, 1988.
- Fowke, Edith. "A Personal Odyssey and Personal Prejudices", in *Undisciplined Women: Tradition and Culture in Canada*, eds. Pauline Greenhill and Diane Tye, pp. 39-48. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1997.
- Fowke, Edith and Carole Carpenter, eds. *Explorations in Canadian Folklore*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985.
- Fowke, Edith and Joe Glazer, eds. *Songs of Work and Protest*. New York: Dover Publications, 1973.
- Fowke, Edith and Richard Johnston, eds. *Folk Songs of Canada*. Waterloo, Ont.: Waterloo Music, 1954.
- Fowke, Edith and Alice Kane. *Songs and Sayings of an Ulster Childhood*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1983.
- Fowke, Edith and Alan Mills, eds. *O Canada: A History in Song*. New York: Folkways FW 3001 [1956].
- Fowke, Edith and Alan Mills, eds. *Folk Songs of Quebec*. Waterloo: Waterloo Music, 1957.
- Fowke, Edith and Alan Mills, eds. *Canada's Story in Song*. Toronto: Gage, 1960.
- Fowke, Edith and Jay Rahn. *A Family Heritage: The Story and Songs of LaRena Clark*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 1994.
- Greenhill, Pauline. *Ethnicity in the Mainstream: Three Studies of English Canadian Culture in Ontario*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994.
- Greenhill, Pauline. "Neither a Man nor a Maid": Sexualities and Gendered Meanings in Cross-Dressing Ballads", *Journal of American Folklore* 108 (1995):156-177.
- Greenhill, Pauline and Peter Narváez. "Introduction: Folklore in Canada", *Journal of American Folklore* 115 (2002):116-128.
- Greenhill, Pauline and Peter Narváez. "Afterword: The Journal of American Folklore and Americanist versus Canadianist Traditions", *Journal of American Folklore* 115 (2002):283-292.
- Greenhill, Pauline and Diane Tye. "Critiques from the Margin: Women and Folklore in English Canada", in *Canada: Theoretical Discourse*, eds. Terry Goldie, Carmen Lambert, and Rowland Lorimer, pp.167-185. Montreal: Association of Canadian Studies, 1994.
- Higginbotham, C.H. *Off the Record: The CCF in Saskatchewan*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1968.
- Kirby, Allan. "What Ordinary People Do Is Important: Edith Fowke's Life And Publications", *Canadian Journal for Traditional Music*, 26 (1998):1-16.
- Kramarae, Cherie and Paula A Treichler. *The Feminist Dictionary*. London: Pandora Press, 1985.
- McKay, Ian. *The Quest of the Folk: Antimodernism and Cultural Selection in Twentieth-Century Nova Scotia*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994.
- Melnyk, Olenka. *No Bankers in Heaven: Remembering the CCF*. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1989.
- Morley, J.T. *Secular Socialists: The CCF/NDP in Ontario, A Biography*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1984.
- Narváez, Peter. *The Protest Songs of a Labor Union On Strike Against an American Corporation in a Newfoundland Company Town; A Folkloristic Analysis With Special References to Oral Folk History*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: University Microfilms International, 1986 (publication no. 86-07-398).
- Narváez, Peter. "Folkloristics, Cultural Studies and Popular Culture". *Canadian Folklore canadien* 14 #1 (1992):15-30.
- Narváez, Peter. "Newfoundland Vernacular Songs", in *Popular Music--Style and Identity*, eds. Will Straw, Stacey Johnson, Rebecca Sullivan, and Paul Friedlander. Montreal: The Centre for Research on Canadian Cultural Institutions and Industries, 1995.
- O'Donnell, John C. "'Join the Union Or You'll Die': Songs Relating to the Labour Union Movement in Canada's Coal Mining Communities", *Canadian Folklore canadien* 14 #2 (1992):113-136.
- Ryan, Shannon and Larry Small, eds. *Haulin' Rope and Gaff: Songs and Poetry of the Newfoundland Seal Fishery*. St. John's: Breakwater Books, 1978.
- Sangster, Joan. "'Women and the New Era': The Role of Women in the Early CCF, 1933-1940," in *Building the Co-operative Commonwealth': Essays on the Democratic Socialist Tradition in Canada*, ed. J. William Brennan, pp. 69-98. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, 1984.

Taylor, Georgina. "The Women...Shall Help to Lead the Way": Saskatchewan CCF-NDP Women Candidates in Provincial and Federal Elections, 1934-1965," in *Building the Co-operative Commonwealth: Essays on the Democratic Socialist Tradition in Canada*, ed. J. William Brennan, pp. 141-160. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, 1984.

Tye, Diane. "'A Very Lone Worker': Women-Centred Thoughts on Helen Creighton's Career as a Folklorist", *Canadian Folklore canadien* 15: #2 (1994): 107-118.

Young, Walter D. *Anatomy of a Party: The National CCF 1932-61*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969.

Notes

1. I appreciate the support of the University of Winnipeg in giving me a Travel Grant to attend the International Ballad Conference in Austin, Texas, in June 2003, where I presented a version of this paper. I also thank Peter Narváez and members of the *Canadian Folk Music* editorial board for helpful comments.

2. See Carpenter 1979.

3. See Narváez 1995.

4. Now the Cultural Studies Division at the Canadian Museum of Civilisation.

5. See McKay (1994:145-150) and Croft (1999).

6. See Tye (1993), and Greenhill and Tye (1994).

7. Note, however, a biographical study by Allan Kirby (1998).

8. Including Higginbotham (1968), Young (1969), and Bradley (1985).

9. See Azoulay (1997) and Morley (1984). Morley notes that Fowke, as an officer of the Woodsworth Foundation, "consistently opposed the anti-Communist measures and caused the party leadership considerable embarrassment". (85).

10. Later republished with corrections as *Songs of Work and Protest* (1973).

11. See for example Fowke (1970) and Ryan and Small (1978).

12. As Peter Narváez suggests, "protest song" is an analytical category rather than indigenous terminology. Most of the singers and audience he consulted for his thesis referred to the material as "union songs." Narváez refers to the work of Serge Denisoff, who distinguished between "magnetic" songs, describing a situation and remedy to reaffirm and recruit, and the "rhetorical" song which simply describes. But Narváez also innovatively notes that the protest in a song need not be in its textual content, but might instead come from actions of the performer (or, for that matter, from the audience): "Once a song performance recounts the past without reference to the present it is not a protest, it is a reminiscence. It is impossible to judge a protest song as such without sufficient contextual data, because although the verbal content of a song may predispose or bias its social use, it does not determine it." The sometimes ephemeral nature of protest songs may

result as much from the lack of interest by folklorists for preserving them. Such a distinguished American folklorist as Tristram Potter Coffin, in the 1950s, declaimed in a kind of self-fulfilling prophecy that folksongs, reflecting the folk, had absolutely no interest in protest or change. (Narváez 1986).

13. The tapes were marked 8/87, with no other identifying information. They are deposited in the Indiana University Archives, but are not yet catalogued. I use them with permission from the archivist.

14. See note 2.

15. "The Frank Slide" is the one song that did not continue into Fowke's updating of *CSS, Singing Our History* (see Bartlett 1984).

16. Nitchie is an ethnic slur for First Nations.

17. A rare critical evaluation of Fowke's work (Bartlett 1984) raises similar concerns.

18. *The Feminist Dictionary* (Kramarae and Treichler 1985) gives no first coinage date for the term feminist, but the first use of the word it quotes is Rebecca West's justly famous, "I myself have never been able to find out precisely what feminism is: I only know that people call me a feminist whenever I express sentiments that differentiate me from a doormat...." published in 1913, the date of Fowke's birth.

19. Fowke's place as a woman in the CCF can be understood in the context of studies by Sangster (1985), Taylor (1985), and Melnyk (1989).

20. Contained in the CCF collection, William Ready Division of Archives and Research Collections, McMaster University Library, Hamilton, Ontario.

21. One third of the Presidents of The Folklore Studies Association of Canada have been women; the majority of the winners of the Luc Lacoucière Award (outstanding student in their first year of graduate studies in folklore/ethnology) have been women; and nine women have won the Distinguished Canadian Folklorist award or its successor the Marius Barbeau medal.

22. Notoriously, people from Ontario are most likely to identify themselves as Canadians, whereas people from Newfoundland call themselves Newfoundlanders, people from Manitoba Manitobans, and so on (see also Greenhill 1994 on Canadian mainstream ethnicity).
